Essay 3— Argument Research Essay, Environmental Conservation—Conflicts between Western, Developing Nation, and Indigenous Paradigms

Over the past couple of weeks, we have been coming to understand that the environmental conservation movement, while noble in its goals, is informed by white western assumptions of what nature, wilderness, and conservation mean that sometimes contrast with the viewpoints of developing nations and indigenous peoples. Roderick Nash’s *Wilderness and the American Mind* and Mark Dowie’s *Conservation Refugees* have helped us do that.

We are learning about particular groups—the Maasai and the Kayapo, for example—to get a sense of how this issue affects indigenous people. We will also want to learn more about the perspectives of environmental groups that Dowie may not represent so fully and about how the conservation field is changing in response to these criticisms. You will watch a portion of a PBS documentary, *Earth: A New Wild*, to get a sense of how the field is changing.

In the research essay that will come out of this work, you will confront the following issue and make one of the following two claims:

**Issue:** Western conservation has traditionally imagined wilderness to be free of human impact, so it has evicted indigenous people from national parks. In many cases, the result has been that indigenous people’s human rights have been compromised, and they have fallen into poverty and/or experienced severe cultural loss. Indigenous people have sometimes resorted to illegally occupying land, poaching, or partnering with extractive industries to improve their economic well-being.

**Option #1:** Imagine yourself working for a BINGO and having to claim that despite the unfortunate impact of eviction on indigenous people, they should not be allowed to settle in nature preserves because of the negative impact they will have on the environment.

**Option #2:** Imagine yourself working for a BINGO and claiming that indigenous people should be allowed to live or travel through nature preserves and to take part in decision-making about sustainable conservation or preservation.

You will use your Nash and Dowie readings, your research, *Allyn & Bacon*’s chapter 13, “Writing a Classical Argument,” and the chapter on inductive and deductive reasoning that I provided from Rottenberg and Haisty Winchell’s *Elements of Argument* to craft your essay and support your claims. You will strive for strong reasoning and avoidance of fallacies. You should also respond to, either rebutting or conceding to, the reasoning of opposing views with which you disagree. The framework for our classical argument is on *Allyn & Bacon* p. 331.

**Formatting and citation in MLA style:**

- Typed in or converted to Word for uploading to Blackboard
- Formatted in MLA style (model in *A & B* p. 405)
• Double-spaced throughout (Check the box to prevent Word from adding extra space every time you press “Enter.”)
• 12-point Times New Roman font
• 1-inch margins (click on Page Layout to check this)
• Left-hand justification
• Title (not in quotes, underlined, or bolded, but just centered at top of essay)
• Heading and page header (upper right-hand corner header for last name and page number, upper left-hand corner heading on page 1 with your name, my name, course number, and due date, in day, month, year format)

• Works Cited list (6 sources: use of NoodleBib strongly recommended):
  o Required texts and types of texts:
    ▪ Conservation Refugees;
    ▪ Wilderness and the American Mind;
    ▪ Article from a reference encyclopedia;
    ▪ Two websites: perhaps one from a BINGO and one about the people or nature preserve under discussion;
    ▪ Two articles: at least one of them scholarly. (Another option would be a chapter of a book.)
  o Required information and perspectives:
    ▪ Background on indigenous people discussed: Maasai or Kayapo or other based on research or Dowie reading (Karen, Basarwa, etc.);
    ▪ Background on environmental debates in area inhabited by people you will be discussing;
    ▪ Information about perspectives of environmentalists/BINGOs that may not be represented, or represented completely or fairly, in the Dowie;
    ▪ Reasons to support your claim;
    ▪ Counterarguments to your claim.

• Authors’ Ideas Integrated in MLA style (A & B Skills 22.2 and 22.3)
• Plagiarism avoided with proper paraphrase and quotation (A & B Skill 22.4)
• Figure 13.1 Framework for a Classical Argument followed

100 POINTS
7-8 PAGES
DUE December 13, 11:30 am